

Addendum to REPORT NUMBER:H&E/12/102 (Non Council Officer members of the Stake Holder Group

**Introduction**

The following addendum offers further details and narrative not covered in the report defined above, but are of significance in respect of assessing potential Short Term Halting Sites.

**Observation**

In particular the Stake Holder Group (non officers) acknowledge that Hazelhead disused Caravan Site scored highest of all five sites assessed, whereas the Howes Road Site scored highest of the three sites identified for consideration.

**Narrative**

The evolution of the revised matrix system was achieved over a course of phases. As stated in the section titled “Option Appraisal and Recommended Site” a number of dry runs were performed with a view to assessing the performance of the Revised Matrix system at a stage prior to introduction of the Essential Parameter Factor. Sites proposed included an array ranging from wholly unsuitable, such as the privately owned site depicted below, the illegal encampment site situated on the Queens Links, to established sites such as Clinterty Halting Site and the Hazelhead disused caravan park which had been identified for consideration at an earlier juncture.



(Map 1)

Since the Stake Holder Group is a wholly apolitical organization, and further, that parameter assessment is very largely based on assessment of physical attributes of a potential site, Hazelhead Park was selected as a probable example of a good site and the site positioned off King Street as depicted in map 1, as an example of a probable poor site.

Due to time constraints only two sites could be used for the purposes of dry runs.

The results are presented below, for each:

	<b>Illegal Encampment Site off King Street</b>	<b>Score (0-10)</b>	<b>Weight (0-5)</b>	<b>Weighted Score</b>	<b>Comment</b>
	<b>Site Constraints</b>				
1	**Size of Site?	10	5	50	
2	Is the land in a SEPA flood map area?	10	5	50	
3	Is the land on the Contaminated Land Register?		0	0	
4	**Local Development Plan Issue?	0	5	0	
5	Adequate space for parking, turning and servicing on site?	10	5	50	
6	**Is there adequate and safe access?	0	5	0	
	<b>Site Characteristics</b>				
7	Allows capacity for growth?	8	3	24	
8	Reasonably flat?	8	3	24	
9	Hard Standing?	0	3	0	
10	Readily available e.g. public ownership/willing landowner/vacant possession?	0	4	0	
11	Free from potential hazards? (pylons, etc)	5	3	15	
12	Previously developed land?	0	3	0	
13	Adequate security arrangements (Privacy, screening, landscaping)	10	4	40	
	<b>Highway Issues</b>				
14	Specific site access? (is there sharing of access)	0	3	0	
15	**Safe pedestrian access?	10	5	50	
16	**Access for emergency vehicles?	1	5	5	
17	Access to public transport?	10	2	20	
18	Impact on core path network?	2	3	6	
	<b>Infrastructure</b>				
19	Access to water?	7	3	21	
20	Access to electricity?	7	2	14	
21	Access to drainage?	7	2	14	
22	Access to sewerage?	7	2	14	
23	Access to lighting?	7	2	14	
24	Waste Disposal?	7	2	14	
	<b>Local Services</b>				
25	Access to schools (capacity available)	10	4	40	
26	Access to Primary health care (capacity available)	10	5	50	
27	Access to Council owned community facilities	10	3	30	

28	Access to Food shops	10	2	20	
<b>Potential Environmental Impacts</b>					
29	Is there an impact on international, national or local designated sites or species?	4	5	20	
30	Protected trees/woodland/designated areas?	10	4	40	
31	Compatibility with landscape?	3	4	12	
32	Greenspace network implications?	4	5	20	
<b>Amenity Areas</b>					
33	Effect on the amenity of neighbouring properties e.g. Proximity and overlooking?	2	5	10	
34	Acceptable to Gypsies/Travellers?	8	5	40	
35	Is the site located in acceptable surroundings away from industrial sites/motorways/rivers?	8	4	32	
<b>Total</b>				<b>739</b>	
<b>Factor (calculated using five essential criteria identified by **)</b>				<b>0</b>	$= \left( \frac{10 \times 0 \times 0 \times 10 \times 1}{1} \right)^{1/5} / 10$
<b>Overall Score</b>				<b>0</b>	= Factor x Total

	<b>Hazelhead Disused Caravan Park</b>	<b>Score (0-10)</b>	<b>Weight (0-5)</b>	<b>Weighted Score</b>	<b>Comment</b>
<b>Site Constraints</b>					
1	**Size of Site?	10	5	50	
2	Is the land in a SEPA flood map area?	10	5	50	
3	Is the land on the Contaminated Land Register?		0	0	
4	**Local Development Plan Issue?	5	5	25	
5	Adequate space for parking, turning and servicing on site?	10	5	50	
6	**Is there adequate and safe access?	10	5	50	
<b>Site Characteristics</b>					
7	Allows capacity for growth?	10	3	30	
8	Reasonably flat?	10	3	30	
9	Hard Standing?	10	3	30	
10	Readily available e.g. public ownership/willing landowner/vacant possession?	10	4	40	
11	Free from potential hazards? (pylons, etc)	10	3	30	
12	Previously developed land?	10	3	30	

13	Adequate security arrangements (Privacy, screening, landscaping)	8	4	32	
<b>Highway Issues</b>					
14	Specific site access? (is there sharing of access)	8	3	24	
15	**Safe pedestrian access?	10	5	50	
16	**Access for emergency vehicles?	9	5	45	
17	Access to public transport?	9	2	18	
18	Impact on core path network?	8	3	18	
<b>Infrastructure</b>					
19	Access to water?	9	3	27	
20	Access to electricity?	9	2	18	
21	Access to drainage?	9	2	18	
22	Access to sewerage?	9	2	18	
23	Access to lighting?	8	2	16	
24	Waste Disposal?	9	2	18	
<b>Local Services</b>					
25	Access to schools (capacity available)	9	4	36	
26	Access to Primary health care (capacity available)	7	5	35	
27	Access to Council owned community facilities	10	3	30	
28	Access to Food shops	8	2	16	
<b>Potential Environmental Impacts</b>					
29	Is there an impact on international, national or local designated sites or species?	8	5	40	
30	Protected trees/woodland/designated areas?	10	4	40	
31	Compatibility with landscape?	9	4	36	
32	Greenspace network implications?	7	5	35	
<b>Amenity Areas</b>					
33	Effect on the amenity of neighbouring properties e.g. Proximity and overlooking?	10	5	50	
34	Acceptable to Gypsies/Travellers?	9	5	45	
35	Is the site located in acceptable surroundings away from industrial sites/motorways/rivers?	10	4	40	
<b>Total</b>				<b>1121</b>	
<b>Factor (calculated using five essential criteria identified by **)</b>				<b>0.85</b>	$= \frac{((10 \times 5 \times 10 \times 10 \times 9)^{1/5})}{10}$
<b>Overall Score</b>				<b>955</b>	= Factor x Total

The table below illustrates the importance of the Essential Parameter Factor.

<b>Site</b>	<b>Total Score without Essential Parameter Factor</b>	<b>Total Score with Essential Parameter Factor</b>
<b>Hazelhead</b>	1121	955
<b>Howes Road</b>	1069	951
<b>Springhill</b>	921	598
<b>Map 1</b>	739	0
<b>Scotstown</b>	735	0

The outcome demonstrated the limitation of the revised Matrix in the absence of the Essential Parameter Factor, and subsequently it was decided unanimously to employ said factor in the Site assessment formula.

The dry runs described above proved useful on two counts, firstly it illustrated that even with weighting, essential parameters would have too little influence on the Revised Matrix final score, and secondly, that the generated dry run data could be used for comparison purposes when performing the parameter by parameter assessments of the actual sites for consideration. This extra data increased the scope of results available for comparison considerably.

It was undeniable that the disused Caravan Site at Hazelhead scored well, and in fact scored highest of all five sites considered. It was also identified, in particular, that the site could be situated hundreds of meters from the nearest residential area and that there was a great deal of natural acoustic and visual screening available in the form of mature trees. Of all the sites, it was concluded that, the Hazelhead disused Caravan Park could possibly offer the best chance of yielding a site that, with appropriate management regime and other associated mitigation measures, could deliver an operationally effective site with extremely limited impact on the local community.

Subsequently, it was proposed that Hazelhead disused Caravan Park should be reconsidered, on physical merits, as a possible Short Term Halting Site.

Corrections:

For Scotstown Recycling Centre proposed site, blue text denotes corrections

	<b>Total</b>			<b>735</b>	
	<b>Factor (calculated using five essential criteria identified by **)</b>			<b>0</b>	<b>= ((2 x 5 x 0 x 0 x 2)<sup>1/5</sup>) / 10</b>
	<b>Overall Score</b>			<b>0</b>	<b>= Factor x Total</b>

For Howes Road proposed site, blue text denotes corrections

	<b>Total</b>			<b>1069</b>	
	<b>Factor (calculated using five essential criteria identified by **)</b>			<b>0.89</b>	<b>= ((8 x 7 x 10 x 10 x 10)<sup>1/5</sup>) / 10</b>
	<b>Overall Score</b>			<b>951</b>	<b>= Factor x Total</b>

For Springhill Road

	<b>Total</b>			<b>921</b>	
	<b>Factor (calculated using five essential criteria identified by **)</b>			<b>0.65</b>	<b>= ((6 x 5 x 4 x 5 x 10)<sup>1/5</sup>) / 10</b>
	<b>Overall Score</b>			<b>599</b>	<b>= Factor x Total</b>

The formula for the Essential Parameter Factor is:

$$(((\text{line 1 score}) \times (\text{line 4 score}) \times (\text{line 6 score}) \times (\text{line 15 score}) \times (\text{line 16 score}))^{1/5}) / 10$$